



Cincinnati City Officials' Public Statements About Contact Card Report

#	Published	Source	Person's Name	City Statement(s)	Campaign Zero Response
1	6/11/2026	Enquirer	Mollie Lair (Director, Communications)	"Disparity and crime levels cannot be assumed to be accurate if demographic changes are not taken into account," Lair said. Lair said the report uses districtwide population as a benchmark for individual officers, even though officers may work smaller beats with different demographics.	<p>When we conducted our individual officer analysis, we used district level data to provide a geographic analysis of the contact card data, as that was the only option for data that was both complete and publicly available. In the contact card dataset, 66% of beat and district entries are missing or blank. To solve this problem, we use the geographic coordinates recorded for each stop and overlay them against the district/beat boundaries to determine where each stop occurred.</p> <p>We used district-level data when calculating the officer-level stop disparities (tables 3, 4, B.2-5) in the first draft of the report, because that was what data was publicly available at the time. The report notes that beat-level data would be preferable (page 31), were it available.</p> <p>After our meeting with the City Manager and her team, CPD sent us a file on June 11 via email containing beat boundaries. The officer-level tables on the website reflect this requested beat-level analysis, not the previous district-level analysis. As a result, the highest recorded disparity has moved from 29x to 21x for Black residents stopped by that officer compared to White citizens.</p> <p>The beat boundaries that they sent us on June 11th were not publically available and are not currently on the Cincinnati Open Data Portal.</p>
2	6/11/2026	NPR	Sheryl Long (City Manager)	"I think what's important in the Collaborative Agreement is collaboration," Long said. "When you look at something like this that was not done in collaboration with us, that is the exact opposite of what we ask for as a city. Nonetheless, we are moving forward."	<p>The statement provided by the city regarding collaboration is both surprising and untrue. In order for any analysis to be independent, unbiased, and accurate, those in power should not be able to make decisions that affect the methodology. The data used for our analysis was provided directly by the Cincinnati Police Department.</p> <p>We shared the report and met with city officials, including Ms. Long, in advance of our release, in the spirit of collaboration and transparency.</p>



Cincinnati City Officials' Public Statements About Contact Card Report

#	Published	Source	Person's Name	City Statement(s)	Campaign Zero Response
					<p>We contacted the City Manager on Tuesday, June 2nd and offered to meet in-person any time on Thursday (6/4) or Friday (6/5). The City Manager replied that she was unable to meet on the proposed dates. As a result, the meeting was moved to Monday, June 8th. The City Manager received the report in advance of our meeting via email on Thursday, June 4th.</p> <p>In this meeting, we answered questions and received feedback from City officials. The City requested small group meetings with Director of Communications Mollie Lair and Sr. Data Analyst Dr. Jillian Desmond, as follow up to the larger meeting. Dr. Jillian Desmond gave feedback on behalf of the City both in the large group meeting, in a meeting with the research team, and a follow-up email. She later provided the non-public beat-level boundaries (June 11th) for us to complete the officer-level analysis.</p> <p>On Tuesday, June 9th, we met with Mollie Lair. During this meeting, we told her that we would be delaying the release of the report so that we could run the additional analyses they requested and to add it to our release. We met with Dr. Desmond on Wednesday, June 10th and after discussing her questions, notified her that we would delay the report's release to complete the additional analyses. Both Ms. Lair and Dr. Desmond acknowledged, in writing, that they understood that we were going to delay the report to include the additional analyses.</p> <p>To our surprise, the Interim Chief Hennie and City Manager Long released statements attacking the report ahead of release and claiming that they did not have any opportunity to influence it. As a result, the report went live without the analyses that they requested included.</p>
3	6/11/2026	NPR	Aftab Pureval (Mayor)	"The bedrock of the Collaborative is open and transparent information, and CPD has repeatedly	In order for any analysis to be independent, unbiased, and accurate, those in power should not be able to

#	Published	Source	Person's Name	City Statement(s)	Campaign Zero Response
				demonstrated a commitment to self evaluation. It is frustrating that the City was prevented from engaging on the study, especially when there are outstanding questions about the results," Pureval said. "We have a responsibility to take allegations of racial bias extremely seriously. I support CPD and our Administration in their work to fully review this report, and we will make sure the resources are there to implement any necessary studies and recommendations. Like all our work, if the findings show a systemic problem, they will be addressed immediately."	<p>make decisions that inform the methodology. The data used for our analysis was provided directly by the Cincinnati Police Department.</p> <p>The City was not prevented from participating in the analyses – in fact, we have incorporated feedback from the City in the analysis. It is true that no member of City leadership had any decision-making role in the report and it appears that this fact is truly the issue at hand. It is not clear that the City truly believes in an independent analysis of public data or any analysis that they cannot control. That is disappointing.</p> <p>We previewed the report to the city, including Mayor Pureval's Chief of Staff, in advance of our public release and we let them know that we were available to meet at any time. The Mayor's Office did not reach out at any time in any capacity following this meeting.</p>
4	6/11/2026	NPR	"Police Department Data Analyst"	Geographic issues bring up other questions about some of the findings in the report, a police department data analyst told WVXU. For example, there are a number of spots around the city, including some highly-trafficked areas, that are often incorrectly geocoded. That means they don't map accurately in large datasets. The police official had questions about how the Campaign Zero analysis accounted for that phenomenon.	<p>Any geographic coding issues are the responsibility of the city. The data we used was provided by the Cincinnati Police Department through a public records request.</p> <p>A solution to this would be for CPD to require officers to complete all location fields in contact card records. Currently, 66% of district and beat fields are missing or blank.</p> <p>It appears that the City is aware that there are data integrity issues in the underlying data and have allowed those issues to continue. Why?</p>
5	6/12/2026	Enquirer	Mollie Lair (Director, Communications)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. City spokeswoman Mollie Lair said the report doesn't fully factor in calls for service throughout the city. Neighborhoods with more calls for service will have higher police presence, she said. 2. The report relies on 2020 U.S. Census data for population and demographic information even though the stop data spans 2009 to 2025, the statement said. 3. The report uses districtwide population as a 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. We are reporting outcomes (stop disparities) and potential contributing factors separately. Separating the reporting of outcomes and potential explanations for those outcomes is a standard practice in scientific research. In our initial analysis, we analyzed total crime rates both as a correlate on a neighborhood level and as a factor in a model to estimate how different factors contribute to the disparities. <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Based on a request from the CPD, we

#	Published	Source	Person's Name	City Statement(s)	Campaign Zero Response
				benchmark for individual officers, even though officers may work smaller beats with different demographics, Lair said.	<p>also analyzed 911 call data and correlated them with the disparities on a neighborhood level, which can be found on pages 8-9 and 17-20 of the Report Addendum. We also correlated disparities and poverty rates.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 2. All of the time-series analyses in the report use all available years of Census population estimates (from the American Community Survey), which span 2009-2024. Block-level neighborhood, time of day, initial reason, and age disparity analyses were done using only 2020 population data. Since receiving this feedback, we redid the following analyses using ACS data: (a) the time of day analysis and (b) the block-level analysis in the report, which used only 2020 Census data, because block-level data is only collected once every 10 years. <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. We replicated the analysis using 2009-2023 ACS data, which can be found on page 12 of the Report Addendum. There are no substantive changes. b. In response to a request from the CPD, we have re-run these block-level analyses using 2010 block data for stop years 2009-2015, and 2020 block data for 2016-2025. These can be found on pages 12-16 of the Report Addendum. 3. See row 1 of this table.
6	6/12/2026	ABC 9	Ken Kober (FOP President)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. "Their method is just to come in here, make the police look as bad as they possibly can, and then they leave, and they just go on to the next city, and do the same thing," Kober said. 2. Kober said the report omitted traffic stop data from Cincinnati's expressways, which would change the racial breakdown of stops 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Campaign Zero has worked on issues related to policing in Cincinnati before and remains committed to supporting Cincinnati with any structural changes following the report's release. 2. At the time of his quote, Mr. Kober stated, "I haven't read the complete report." We are

#	Published	Source	Person's Name	City Statement(s)	Campaign Zero Response
				significantly. "Talk to a traffic officer, like 75 to 80, 85% of the people that we stop on the expressways are white," Kober said. "You could give me any kind of data, and I can skew it to be able to fit a narrative that I want to portray."	<p>happy to meet with him once he has read the entire report.</p> <p>Once he reads through the report, it will be clear to him that our initial report includes highway stops. To his point, highways (expressways) have a higher White percentage than neighborhood stops. When we exclude interstates from all other motor vehicle stops, racial disparities worsen.</p>
7	6/12/2026	ABC 9	Carl Lewis (Criminal Defense Attorney)	Lewis said he wants to see the analysis broadened to include data from other Cincinnati neighborhoods and neighboring communities before drawing firm conclusions.	Our report includes data from all Cincinnati neighborhoods, not just those with a high number of stops. Every neighborhood is included in both our report and on contactcards.org .
8	6/12/2026	NBC 5	Ken Kober (FOP President)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Kober elaborated on the missing context, saying, "Well, a perfect example of this, and you know, they don't have any contact cards is my understanding. I haven't read the complete report, but my understanding is there's no contact cards for stops that were made on the expressway." 2. "They refused Iris Roley to be a part of this," Kober said. "Who said, hey, look, I'm part of the collaborative agreement. Let me weigh in on this. Let me let's see if this data is correct. They refuse to allow her to do it. So it tells me that their intentions were just to come here, create a mess and leave." 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Of all the motor vehicle stops we analyzed in the contact cards data (403,037), 11.9% were on the interstate (47,838). See pages 1-5 of the report addendum for details. 2. Iris Roley was present in the presentation to City officials on Monday, June 8th. Following this meeting, we received feedback from Ms. Roley on the report. 3. No employee, contractor, or elected official in Cincinnati was in any decision-making capacity related to the report. <p>In order for any analysis to be independent, unbiased, and accurate, those in power should not be able to make decisions that affect the methodology before or while an analysis is in the process of being completed.</p>
9	6/12/2026	Local 12	Ken Kober (FOP President)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Cincinnati Fraternal Order of Police President Ken Kober said he did not know the analysis was being done until a week ago and said he believes the public defender's office commissioned the analysis for different reasons. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. City officials received a copy of the report before its public release and were given time to provide feedback. We delayed the report's release to incorporate the City's feedback only to have them release statements before the feedback had been incorporated.

#	Published	Source	Person's Name	City Statement(s)	Campaign Zero Response
				<p>"What I've seen is that this report is very, very misleading, and to be quite honest, in my opinion, it's just been done to try to destroy police and community relations, something that we've built for the last 25 years, we've worked very hard at," said Kober. "To have an outside agency come in and go, 'Yeah, we're going to do this,' and then you're gonna drop this bomb and then leave. To me, it's absolute nonsense."</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Kober said the report is flawed because it says the data is solely from officers who initiate stops. Campaign Zero analyzed contact cards officers fill out any time they stop someone. The system was born out of the Collaborative Agreement. Kober said officers who conduct traffic and pedestrian stops are required to fill out contact cards, but other officers also fill out cards when they talk to people for investigative reasons. Kober also said officers who were named in the report are mostly those officers, not patrol officers. "Our Crime Gun Intelligence Center, their sole function is to be gun violence interrupters," said Kober. "They don't know if the person's white. They don't if they're Black. They don't know if they are male. They don't know if they're female. All they know is that someone was firing a gun in this area. So, to say that they're just going out stopping African Americans for no reason is absolute nonsense. They had one [in the report], is actually a police captain, whose an African American that said that he stopped 137 African Americans. He's a police captain. He didn't stop anybody." 	<p>No one has paid Campaign Zero to conduct these analyses or to publish the report.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Kober has not actually read the complete report. The report includes a list of supervisors listed by the stops of their direct reports, not who the supervisors stopped. If there are officers with misattributed stops, that is an issue with the CPD's data provided in the public records releases.
10	6/12/2026	700 WLW	Ken Kober (FOP President)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> "You look at the officers that are on [this report] and where they're assigned, they're assigned to units like our crime gun intelligence center who goes and they get the reports from ShotSpotters, where shots 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> We have an entire section in our report devoted to analyzing whether or not crime is a predictor of these racial disparities ("Crime Rates and Police Stops" beginning on page 19). Crime is <i>not</i> a significant predictor of the racial



Cincinnati City Officials' Public Statements About Contact Card Report

#	Published	Source	Person's Name	City Statement(s)	Campaign Zero Response
				<p>have been fired in the city. They go there, they'll collect shell casings, and then they start investigations in those areas and look to see 'who are firing these rounds?' They don't have a suspect, they know that in this area somebody fired these shots. I don't know how [Campaign Zero] comes up with 'oh, they just stop all the Black people in this neighborhood.' What they're doing there is they're conducting these investigations and then all of a sudden see people that are armed. They investigate further because we know that you can carry guns in Ohio – that's what the law says, which is fine – but then they see people actually firing rounds and they go and stop them while they happen to be African American. And all of a sudden we're up in arms about the police doing their job.”</p> <p>2. “When you look to see who the police officers are who are listed, a couple of them work in violent crime squads. If we're having a problem with gun violence in Avondale, well, Avondale I think from the 2020 census is like 89% African American. So naturally, who do you think is driving crime in Avondale? Well, there's an 89% chance it's probably going to be African American. So they go to those areas and target gun violence. They don't target somebody by their race, they target them by who's committing crimes in those areas.”</p>	<p>disparities in police stops.</p> <p>2. Disparity rates take demographic population into account. If police stopped 89% Black people and 11% people of other races in Avondale, there would be no racial disparity (a 1:1 ratio). The fact that disparities exist mean that police are stopping people <i>beyond what their share of the population would explain.</i></p>